



#### Probabilistic Visibility Estimation using Geometry Proxies

Niels Billen, Ares Lagae, Philip Dutré

Department of Computer of Computer Science KU Leuven, Belgium

### Visibility evaluations in graphics



### Visibility evaluations in graphics



#### Exact visibility evaluation slow, high quality shadows



#### Exact visibility evaluation slow, high quality shadows

#### Approximate visibility evaluation fast, low quality shadows





#### Exact visibility evaluation slow, high quality shadows

#### Approximate visibility evaluation fast, low quality shadows





#### Exact visibility evaluation slow, high quality shadows

#### Approximate visibility evaluation fast, low quality shadows





#### Exact visibility evaluation slow, high quality shadows

 Approximate visibility evaluation fast, low quality shadows

Is it possible to render exact shadows using geometry proxies?





#### Related work

#### Approximate geometry

- Silvennoinen et al. [2014]: Occluder simplification using planar sections.
- Décoret X et al. [2003]: Billboard clouds for extreme model simplification.
- Heckbert et al. [1997]: Survey of polygonal surface simplification algorithms.

► ...

#### Related work

#### Approximate geometry

- Silvennoinen et al. [2014]: Occluder simplification using planar sections.
- Décoret X et al. [2003]: Billboard clouds for extreme model simplification.
- Heckbert et al. [1997]: Survey of polygonal surface simplification algorithms.

▶ ...

#### Stochastic visibility evaluation

 Billen et al. [2013]: Probabilistic visibility estimation for direct illumination.



► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.



V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.



► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.



► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.



- ► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.
- ► V<sub>P'</sub> (x, y): visibility of the geometry proxy.



- ► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.
- ► V<sub>P'</sub> (x, y): visibility of the geometry proxy.



- ► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.
- ► V<sub>P'</sub> (x, y): visibility of the geometry proxy.



- ► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.
- ► V<sub>P'</sub> (x, y): visibility of the geometry proxy.
- In general:

 $V_{P}(x,y) \neq V_{P'}(x,y)$ 



- ► V<sub>P</sub> (x, y): visibility of the original geometry.
- ► V<sub>P'</sub> (x, y): visibility of the geometry proxy.
- In general:

$$V_{P}(x,y) \neq V_{P'}(x,y)$$

• Write the exact visibility as:  $V_P(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$ 



 $V_{P}(x, y) V_{P'}(x, y) c(x, y)$ 



$$\frac{V_{P}(x,y) \ V_{P'}(x,y) \ c(x,y)}{T_{ype_{HH'}}} 0 0$$



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
Туре <sub>нн'</sub>	0	0	0



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН'</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН'</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН'</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН′</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1



	$V_{P}(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c (x, y)
Туре <sub>НН'</sub>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	



	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c (x, y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН′</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	0



$V_{P}\left(x,y\right)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
0	0	0
0	1	-1
1	0	1
1	1	0
	V <sub>P</sub> (x,y) 0 1 1	$ \begin{array}{c c} V_{P}(x,y) & V_{P'}(x,y) \\ \hline 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 \end{array} $

$$V_{P}(x,y) = V_{P'}(x,y) + c(x,y)$$

$V_{P}\left(x,y\right)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
0	0	0
0	1	-1
1	0	1
1	1	0
	V <sub>P</sub> (x,y) 0 1 1	$ \begin{array}{c c} V_{P}(x,y) & V_{P'}(x,y) \\ \hline 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 \end{array} $

 $V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$ c(x, y) =

	$V_{P}\left(x,y\right)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
<i>Туре<sub>НН′</sub></i>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	<u>0</u>	<u>1</u>	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	0

$$V_{P}(x,y) = V_{P'}(x,y) + c(x,y)$$
  
 $c(x,y) =$ 

	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c (x, y)
Туре <sub>НН′</sub>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	0

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
$$c(x, y) = -\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}V_{P'}(x, y)$$

$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
0	0	0
0	1	-1
<u>1</u>	<u>0</u>	1
1	1	0
	$V_{P}(x,y)$ $0$ $1$ $1$	$ \begin{array}{c c} V_{P}(x,y) & V_{P'}(x,y) \\ \hline 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \\ \hline 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 1 \end{array} $

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
$$c(x, y) = -\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}V_{P'}(x, y)$$

	$V_{P}\left(x,y\right)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c(x,y)
Туре <sub>НН′</sub>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	0

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
$$c(x, y) = -\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}V_{P'}(x, y)$$
$$+ V_{P}(x, y)\overline{V_{P'}(x, y)}$$
	$V_P(x,y)$	$V_{P'}\left(x,y\right)$	c (x, y)
Туре <sub>НН′</sub>	0	0	0
Туре <sub>НМ'</sub>	0	1	-1
Туре <sub>МН'</sub>	1	0	1
Туре <sub>ММ'</sub>	1	1	0

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
$$c(x, y) = -\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}V_{P'}(x, y)$$
$$+ V_{P}(x, y)\overline{V_{P'}(x, y)}$$

Monte Carlo estimation of a sum:

$$S = s_1 + s_2 + \ldots + s_n$$

Monte Carlo estimation of a sum:

$$S = s_1 + s_2 + \ldots + s_n$$

Pick a single term s<sub>i</sub> with probability p<sub>i</sub>:

$$egin{aligned} & ilde{S} = rac{s_i}{p_i} \ & ilde{S} = rac{1}{M}\sum_{i=1}^Mrac{s_i}{p_i} \ & ilde{E}\left[ ilde{S}
ight] = S \end{aligned}$$

$$V_{P}(x,y) = V_{P'}(x,y) + c(x,y)$$

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
  
=  $V_{P'}(x, y) + V_{P}(x, y) \overline{V_{P'}(x, y)} - V_{P'}(x, y) \overline{V_{P}(x, y)}$ 

$$V_{P}(x, y) = V_{P'}(x, y) + c(x, y)$$
  
=  $V_{P'}(x, y) + V_{P}(x, y) \overline{V_{P'}(x, y)} - V_{P'}(x, y) \overline{V_{P}(x, y)}$ 



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) V_{P}(x, y) G(x, y) dA$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) V_{P}(x, y) G(x, y) dA$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \tilde{V}(x, y) G(x, y) dA$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{p_{Proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x, y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x, y)}}{p_{correction_{+}}} & G(x, y) dA \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}}{p_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases}$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{p_{proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}V_{P'}(x, y)}{p_{correction_{+}}} & G(x, y) dA \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)V_{P}(x, y)}{p_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases}$$



Three cases:

• with probability  $p_{proxy}$ , evaluate  $\frac{V_{p'}(x,y)}{P_{proxy}}$ 

$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{p_{proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{p_{correction_{+}}} \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x,y)}}{p_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases} G(x, y) dA$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{p_{proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}V_{P'}(x, y)}{P_{correction_{+}}} & G(x, y) dA \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)V_{P}(x, y)}{P_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases}$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{P_{Proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{+}}} & G(x, y) dA \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases}$$



- with probability  $p_{proxy}$ , evaluate  $\frac{V_{P'}(x,y)}{p_{proxy}}$
- ▶ with probability  $p_{correction_+}$ , evaluate  $\frac{V_{P(x,y)}V_{P'}(x,y)}{P_{correction_+}}$ : first evaluate  $V_{P'}(x,y)$ :
  - a. if  $V_{P'}(x, y) = 1$ : done b. if  $V_{P'}(x, y) = 0$ : evaluate  $V_P(x, y)$

$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{P_{proxy}} (x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{+}}} \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases} G(x, y) dA$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{P_{Proxy}}(x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{+}}} & G(x, y) dA \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases}$$



$$L_{direct} (x \to \theta) = \int_{A} f(x, \overline{yx} \leftrightarrow \theta) L(y \to x) \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}}{P_{proxy}} (x, y) \\ \frac{V_{P(x,y)}\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{+}}} \\ \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x,y)}}{P_{correction_{-}}} \end{cases} G(x, y) dA$$



Three cases:

14 4 1



Test scene



Test scene



Geometry proxies used for stochastic visibility estimation





Probabilistic evaluation using 32 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 64 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 128 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 256 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 512 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 32 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 64 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 128 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 256 shadow rays





Probabilistic evaluation using 512 shadow rays





Minimize the variance

#### Goals

- Minimize the variance
- Account for cost

#### Goals

- Minimize the variance
- Account for cost
- ► How?

#### Goals

- Minimize the variance
- Account for cost
- ► How?
  - Determine the optimal probabilities p<sub>proxy</sub>, p<sub>correction+</sub> and p<sub>correction-</sub>
P





 $V_{avg} = \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}}$ 



$$\begin{split} V_{avg} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}} \\ f_{hit} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which hit both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} V_{avg} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}} \\ f_{hit} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which hit both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} V_{avg} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}} \\ f_{hit} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which hit both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} \\ f_{miss} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which miss the model}} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} V_{avg} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}} \\ f_{hit} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which hit both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} \\ f_{miss} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which miss the model}} \end{split}$$



$$\begin{split} V_{avg} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss P}}{\# \text{rays which miss P} + \# \text{rays which hit P}} \\ f_{hit} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which hit both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} \\ f_{miss} &= \frac{\# \text{rays which miss both model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which miss the model}} \end{split}$$



Minimizing the variance results in optimal probabilities  $p_{proxy}$ ,  $p_{correction_+}$  and  $p_{correction_-}$ .



► Rays of type *Type<sub>HM'</sub>* do not exist.



▶ Rays of type *Type<sub>HM'</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V}_{P}(x, y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)}{\rho_{proxy}} & \text{probability } \rho_{proxy} \\ \frac{V_{P}(x, y)\overline{V_{P'}(x, y)}}{1 - \rho_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1 - \rho_{proxy} \end{cases}$$



▶ Rays of type *Type<sub>HM'</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V}_{P}(x,y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x,y)}{p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } p_{proxy} \\ \frac{V_{P}(x,y)\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{1-p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1-p_{proxy} \end{cases}$$

• 
$$f_{hit} = \frac{\# \text{rays which hit model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} = 1$$



▶ Rays of type *Type<sub>HM'</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V}_{P}(x,y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x,y)}{p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } p_{proxy} \\ \frac{V_{P}(x,y)\overline{V_{P'}(x,y)}}{1-p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1-p_{proxy} \end{cases}$$

• 
$$f_{hit} = \frac{\# \text{rays which hit model and proxy}}{\# \text{rays which hit the model}} = 1$$

Variance:

$$rac{V_{avg}\left(1-f_{miss}
ight)}{1-p_{proxy}}+rac{V_{avg}f_{miss}}{p_{proxy}}-V_{avg}^{2}$$



$$\blacktriangleright \quad Var\left[\tilde{V}\left(x,y\right)\right] = \frac{V_{avg}\left(1-f_{miss}\right)}{1-\rho_{proxy}} + \frac{V_{avg}f_{miss}}{\rho_{proxy}} - V_{avg}^{2}$$



#rays which miss the model



$$\blacktriangleright \quad Var\left[\tilde{V}\left(x,y\right)\right] = \frac{V_{avg}(1-f_{miss})}{1-\rho_{proxy}} + \frac{V_{avg}f_{miss}}{\rho_{proxy}} - V_{avg}^2$$

•  $f_{miss} = \frac{\# rays which miss both model and proxy}{\# rays which miss the model}$ 



$$\blacktriangleright \quad Var\left[\tilde{V}\left(x,y\right)\right] = \frac{V_{avg}(1-f_{miss})}{1-\rho_{proxy}} + \frac{V_{avg}f_{miss}}{\rho_{proxy}} - V_{avg}^{2}$$

•  $f_{miss} = \frac{\# rays which miss both model and proxy}{\# rays which miss the model}$ 







► 
$$Var\left[\tilde{V}(x,y)\right] = \frac{V_{avg}(1-f_{miss})}{1-p_{proxy}} + \frac{V_{avg}f_{miss}}{p_{proxy}} - V_{avg}^2$$

•  $f_{miss} = \frac{\# rays which miss both model and proxy}{\# rays which miss the model}$ 







Rays of type *Type<sub>MH</sub>* do not exist.



Rays of type *Type<sub>MH'</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V_{P}}(x, y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)}{\rho_{proxy}} & \text{probability } \rho_{proxy} \\ -\frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}}{1 - \rho_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1 - \rho_{proxy} \end{cases}$$



Rays of type *Type<sub>MH</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V_{P}}(x, y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)}{p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } p_{proxy} \\ -\frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}}{1 - p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1 - p_{proxy} \end{cases}$$

• 
$$f_{miss} = \frac{\# rays which miss model and proxy}{\# rays which miss the model} = 1$$



Rays of type *Type<sub>MH'</sub>* do not exist.

Estimator:

$$\tilde{V_{P}}(x, y) = \begin{cases} \frac{V_{P'}(x, y)}{p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } p_{proxy} \\ -\frac{V_{P'}(x, y)\overline{V_{P}(x, y)}}{1 - p_{proxy}} & \text{probability } 1 - p_{proxy} \end{cases}$$

• 
$$f_{miss} = \frac{\# rays \text{ which miss model and proxy}}{\# rays \text{ which miss the model}} = 1$$

Variance:

$$\frac{\left(1-V_{avg}\right)\left(1-f_{hit}\right)}{p_{1}\left(1-p_{proxy}\right)}+\frac{V_{avg}}{p_{proxy}}-V_{avg}^{2}$$



### Minimum variance: Results

#### Problem:

optimal probabilities contain unknown parameters  $V_{\rm avg},$   $f_{\rm hit},~f_{\rm miss}$ 

### Minimum variance: Results

#### Problem:

optimal probabilities contain unknown parameters  $V_{\rm avg},$   $f_{\rm hit},~f_{\rm miss}$ 

#### Solution:

estimate unknown parameters for a shading point x using probe rays.

# Minimum variance: Inside proxies



Minimum variance: Inside proxies



# Minimum variance: Outside proxies



Minimum variance: Outside proxies



# Minimum variance: General proxies



# Minimum variance: General proxies



## Minimum variance: Problem



Original geometry

**Outside proxies**
### Minimum variance: Problem



**Original geometry** 

Outside proxies

Optimal pproxy

# Minimum variance: Problem



Original geometry Outside proxies Optimal p<sub>proxy</sub>

Variance minimization does not account for intersection cost. Therefore the term with the exact visibility will be favored in umbra regions.



Increase  $p_{proxy}$  when  $V_{P}(x, y) \cong V_{P'}(x, y)$ 

error = 
$$\frac{\# \text{ probe rays where } V_P(x, y) \neq V_{P'}(x, y)}{\# \text{ probe rays}}$$

Increase  $p_{proxy}$  when  $V_{P}(x, y) \cong V_{P'}(x, y)$ 

$$error = \frac{\# \text{ probe rays where } V_{P}(x, y) \neq V_{P'}(x, y)}{\# \text{ probe rays}}$$

$$egin{aligned} p_{correction_+}' &= \sqrt[4]{error} \cdot p_{correction_+} \ p_{correction_-}' &= \sqrt[4]{error} \cdot p_{correction_-} \ p_{proxy}' &= 1 - p_{correction_+}' - p_{correction_-}' \end{aligned}$$



**Optimal** p<sub>proxy</sub>

Modified pproxy

# Results: Equal time

#### Exact visibility Outside proxies General proxies (adaptive probabilities) (adaptive probabilities)



 $\textbf{MSE} \qquad \qquad 4.461 \times 10^{-7} \qquad 5.36 \times 10^{-6} \qquad 2.448 \times 10^{-6}$ 

# Results: Equal time



### Conclusion

- Stochastic evaluation of visibility using geometry proxies
  - Unbiased images

### Conclusion

- Stochastic evaluation of visibility using geometry proxies
  - Unbiased images
- Theoretical framework

# Conclusion

- Stochastic evaluation of visibility using geometry proxies
  - Unbiased images
- Theoretical framework
- New and experimental look at visibility
  - Hope to inspire new future work

# Thank you for your attention



### Outside proxies for the famous Nature scene [Pharr10]